

# Contents

Preface to Instructors xvii

## Section I: The Nature of Inquiry

Chapter 1: The Nature and Value of Inquiry	<b>3</b>
Dialogues: <i>“Mystery Meatloaf”</i>	3
<i>“Mystery Meatloaf—Take II”</i>	4
What Is Inquiry?	6
Dialogue: <i>“Cruelty to Chickens?”</i>	9
Occasions for Inquiry	14
The Nature of Inquiry	15
Inquiry and Dialogue	17
The Value of Inquiry	18
The Spirit of Inquiry	19
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>21</b>
Chapter 2: Introducing Guidelines for Inquiry	<b>25</b>
Dialogue: <i>“The Great Film Debate”</i>	25
Guidelines for Inquiry	26
What Is the Issue?	27
What Kinds of Claims or Judgments Are at Issue?	28
What Are the Relevant Reasons and Arguments on Various Sides of the Issue?	29
What Is the Context of the Issue?	31
How Do We Comparatively Evaluate the Various Reasons and Arguments to Reach a Reasoned Judgment?	33
Guidelines for Inquiry: Application	36

Dialogue: <i>“Those Dangerous Dogs”</i>	36
What Is the Issue?	38
What Kinds of Claims or Judgments Are at Issue?	39
What Are the Relevant Reasons and Arguments on Various Sides of the Issue?	40
What Is the Context of the Issue?	43
How Do We Comparatively Evaluate the Various Reasons and Arguments to Reach a Reasoned Judgment?	44
Applying the Guidelines for Inquiry	46
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>48</b>

## Section II: Arguments

Chapter 3: Argument Types and Structure	55
Dialogue: <i>“Raising the Minimum Wage”</i>	55
Argument and Inquiry	57
The Structure of Arguments	57
Standardizing Arguments	57
Standardizing and the Principle of Charity	58
Sub-arguments	60
Argument Tables	60
Two Types of Arguments: Deductive and Inductive	62
Deductive Arguments	63
Categorical Statements and Generalizations	64
Necessary and Sufficient Conditions	65
Unstated Premises and Assumptions	67
Dubious Assumptions	68
Inductive Arguments	68
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>71</b>

Chapter 4: Probative Arguments and Fallacies	<b>75</b>
Dialogue: <i>“The Oldest Profession”</i>	75
Probative Arguments	77
Prima Facie Judgment	78
Fallacies	79
Fallacies of Illusory Support	80
Fallacies of Minimal Support	86
Fallacies of Unacceptability	96
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>101</b>
 Chapter 5: Key Argument Types	 <b>105</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Legalizing Marijuana”</i>	105
Reductio	106
Analogical Arguments	107
Precedent Analogies	107
Causal Analogies	109
Evaluating Analogies	110
Argument and Explanation	115
Reason Explanations	116
Causal Explanations	117
Evaluating Particular Causal Explanations	119
Evaluating General Causal Explanations	121
Evaluating Reason Explanations	125
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>126</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>127</b>
 Chapter 6: Credible Sources and Appeals to Experts	 <b>133</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Vaccination”</i>	133
Evaluating the Credibility of Sources	136
Guiding Questions for Evaluating Sources	137
Finding Credible and Useful Sources	144

Using the Web	146
Guiding Questions for Evaluating Web Sites	149
Misleading or Untrustworthy Sites	150
Using Footnotes to Check Credibility	152
Using Books	154
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>154</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>155</b>

Section III: Conducting an Inquiry

Chapter 7: Identifying the Issue	<b>161</b>
Dialogue: <i>“War?”</i>	161
What Is the Issue?	163
What Is an Issue?	163
Characteristics of an Issue	164
Problems with Language	166
Lack of Clarity	166
Loaded Language	168
Types of Judgments	170
Factual Judgments	172
Evaluative Judgments	173
Interpretive Judgments	178
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>180</b>

Chapter 8: Understanding the Case: Reasons and Context	<b>185</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Capital Punishment”</i>	185
Relevant Reasons and Arguments on Various Sides of the Issue	186
Context of the Issue	187
State of Practice	187
History of the Debate	188
Intellectual, Social, Political, and Historical Contexts	189

Mapping the Contexts	189
Laying Out the Current Debate: Capital Punishment	190
Representing the Current Debate: Argument Table	193
Laying Out the Context: Capital Punishment	195
State of Practice	195
History of the Debate	199
Intellectual, Social, Political, and Historical Contexts	201
Mapping the Context: Capital Punishment	205
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>206</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>206</b>
<b>Chapter 9: Evaluating the Arguments</b>	<b>211</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Capital Punishment II”</i>	211
Evaluating the Main Reasons and Arguments	212
Prima Facie Evaluation	212
Evaluating the Pro Arguments	214
Evaluating the Con Arguments	222
Identifying and Evaluating Additional Arguments	228
Evaluating Individual Arguments: Summing Up	230
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>232</b>
<b>Chapter 10: Making a Judgment and Making a Case</b>	<b>235</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Capital Punishment III”</i>	235
Reaching a Reasoned Judgment	236
Weighing Competing Considerations	239
Dealing with Differences in Weighting	241
Apportioning Judgment	242
Evaluating a Given Case	245
Failures of Judgment	245
Making a Reasonable Case	248
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>255</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>256</b>

Chapter 11: Dialogue and the Spirit of Inquiry	<b>259</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Hate Speech”</i>	259
Achieving the Spirit of Inquiry	265
Dialogue: <i>“Postmortem”</i>	266
Obstacles to the Spirit of Inquiry	267
Fallacious Reasoning	267
Biases in Reasoning	267
Overcoming the Obstacles to Inquiry	273
Conducting a Dialogue	278
Responding to Fallacies	280
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>286</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>286</b>

Section IV: Inquiry in Specific Areas

Chapter 12: Inquiry in the Natural Sciences	<b>293</b>
Dialogue: <i>“I Hate Science!”</i>	293
Inquiry in Geology I: Hutton	294
The Basics of Scientific Reasoning: Arguments and Evaluation	297
Argument to the Best Explanation in the Natural Sciences	299
Inquiry in Geology II: Plate Tectonics	299
The Structure of Inquiry: Plate Tectonics	304
Reasoned Judgment and Scientific Inquiry	305
Dialogue: <i>“Evolution”</i>	309
Inquiry into the Theory of Evolution	309
Science and Statistics	315
Dialogue: <i>“And I Really Hate Statistics!”</i>	316
Inquiry and Statistics: Snow and the Search for the Cause of Cholera	317
The Structure of Inquiry: Snow and the Search for the Cause of Cholera	319

Applying Statistical Techniques in the Physical Sciences: Climate Change	320
Dialogue: <i>“Global Warming”</i>	320
Inquiry into Climate Change	321
Scientific Inquiry: A Final Note	327
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>328</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>328</b>
Chapter 13: Inquiry in the Social Sciences	<b>335</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Video Violence”</i>	335
Assessing Scientific Claims in the Social Sciences: An Inquiry into the Effect of Violent Video Games	337
Evaluation of Claims Based on Statistical Inference	339
Kinds of Studies	340
Evaluating Causal Claims in Statistical Research	347
Considerations for Evaluating Causal Claims in the Social Sciences	349
Studying Human Nature	351
Dialogue: <i>“Human Nature: Nasty or Nice?”</i>	351
Inquiry into Selfishness	353
Further Reflections on the Study of Human Behavior	364
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>366</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>367</b>
Chapter 14: Inquiry in the Arts	<b>371</b>
Dialogue: <i>“Guernica”</i>	371
Inquiry on a Work of Art: <i>Guernica</i>	373
The Nature of Inquiry in the Arts	392
A Public Art Controversy	394
Dialogue: <i>“Tilted Arc”</i>	395
Inquiry: <i>Tilted Arc</i>	400
<b>Check Your Understanding</b>	<b>403</b>
<b>Exercises</b>	<b>404</b>

Chapter 15: Inquiry in Philosophy: Ethics	409
Dialogue: <i>"It's All Relative"</i>	409
Ethical Inquiry	410
Inquiry into Ethical Relativism	411
Inquiry into Polygamy	418
Check Your Understanding	428
Exercises	428
Chapter 16: Inquiry into the Extraordinary	431
Dialogue: <i>"The Secret"</i>	431
Inquiry into <i>The Secret</i>	434
Dialogue: <i>"9/11 Conspiracy?"</i>	449
Conspiracy Theories	451
Inquiry into 9/11 Conspiracy Theory	452
Check Your Understanding	464
Exercises	464
Glossary	469
Figure Credits	479
Index	481